## Comments

## Comments on "Simple and Accurate Formula for the Resonant Frequency of the Equilateral Triangular Microstrip Patch Antenna"

P. Mythili and Annapurna Das

## Index Terms-Microstrip patch antenna, resonance capacitance.

In the above communication, ${ }^{1}$ the authors have given a formula for the resonant frequency of an equilateral triangular microstrip patch antenna. They have used the capacitance formula of a circular microstrip disk given by [2, Eq. (23)], which takes into account the fringing field effects. The capacitance formula given by [1] is

$$
\begin{align*}
C=\frac{a^{2} \pi \varepsilon_{r} \varepsilon_{0}}{h}[1 & +\frac{2 h}{\pi \varepsilon_{r} a}\left\{\ln \left(\frac{a}{2 h}\right)+\left(1.41 \varepsilon_{r}+1.77\right)\right. \\
& \left.\left.+\frac{h}{a}\left(0.268 \varepsilon_{r}+1.65\right)\right\}\right] \tag{1}
\end{align*}
$$

where $a$ is the radius of the circular microstrip disk. For an equilateral triangular microstrip patch antenna with sides of length $l$, the corresponding fringing capacitance of an equivalent circular microstrip disk of same area is given by

$$
\begin{align*}
& C=\frac{a_{\mathrm{eq}}^{2} \pi \varepsilon_{r} \varepsilon_{0}}{h}\left[1+\frac{2 h}{\pi \varepsilon_{r} a_{\mathrm{eq}}}\left\{\ln \left(\frac{a_{\mathrm{eq}}}{2 h}\right)+\left(1.41 \varepsilon_{r}+1.77\right)\right.\right. \\
&\left.\left.+\frac{h}{a_{\mathrm{eq}}}\left(0.268 \varepsilon_{r}+1.65\right)\right\}\right] \tag{2}
\end{align*}
$$

where $a_{\mathrm{eq}}=\sqrt{S / \pi}$ and $S$ is the area of the original triangular patch. The effective radius of the circular microstrip disk is given by

$$
a_{\mathrm{ef}}=a_{\mathrm{eq}}\left[1+\frac{2 h}{\pi \varepsilon_{r} a_{\mathrm{eq}}}\left\{\ln \left(\frac{a_{\mathrm{eq}}}{2 h}\right)+\left(1.41 \varepsilon_{r}+1.77\right)\right.\right.
$$

Manuscript received October 17, 1996.
The authors are with the School of Electronics and Communication Engineering, Anna University, Chennai, 600025 India.

Publisher Item Identifier S 0018-926X(00)02626-0.
${ }^{1}$ N. Kumprasert and W. Kiranon, IEEE Trans. Antennas Propagat., vol. 42, pp. 1178-1179, Aug. 1994.

TABLE I

| Modes | Measured resonant <br> frequency <br> (GHz) | Calculated resonant frequency (GHz) |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Reported [4] | Correctly calculated |
| $\mathbf{T M}_{10,-1}$ |  | 1.289 | 1.258 |
| $\mathbf{T M}_{11,-2}$ | 2.242 | 2.233 | 2.179 |
| $\mathbf{T M}_{20,-2}$ | 2.550 | 2.579 | 2.516 |
| $\mathbf{T M}_{21,-3}$ | 3.400 | 3.411 | 3.329 |
| $\mathbf{T M}_{30,-3}$ | 3.824 | 3.868 | 3.774 |

$a=10 \mathrm{~cm}, \varepsilon_{\mathrm{r}}=2.32, h=0.159 \mathrm{~cm}$.

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left.\left.+\frac{h}{a_{\mathrm{eq}}}\left(0.268 \varepsilon_{r}+1.65\right)\right\}\right]^{1 / 2} \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

The effective side length $l_{\mathrm{ef}}$ of the triangular microstrip patch antenna is calculated by an approach given in [2] and implemented in [3]. The authors ${ }^{1}$ have followed the same approach for the calculation of effective side length $l_{\text {ef }}$. Following the procedure of the paper cited, 1 the formula for $l_{\mathrm{ef}}$ is obtained as

$$
\begin{equation*}
l_{\mathrm{ef}}=l\left(\frac{a_{\mathrm{ef}}}{a_{\mathrm{eq}}}\right) \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $a_{\text {ef }}$ is given by (3).
Equation (6) ${ }^{1}$ is not in agreement with (4) and, hence, the resonance frequencies calculated from (6) ${ }^{1}$ are not in agreement with results obtained from (4). Table I gives the correctly computed results.

## References

[1] W. C. Chen and J. A. Kong, "Effects of fringing fields on the capacitance of circular microstrip disk," IEEE Trans. Microwave Theory Tech., vol. MTT-28, pp. 98-104, 1980.
[2] Y. Suzuki and T. Chiba, "Computer analysis method for arbitrary shaped microstrip antenna with multiterminals," IEEE Trans. Antennas Propagat., vol. AP-32, pp. 585-590, 1984.
[3] R. Singh, A. De, and R. S. Yadava, "Comments on 'An improved formula for the resonant frequency of the triangular microstrip patch antenna'," IEEE Trans. Antennas Propagat., vol. 39, pp. 1443-1444, 1991.

